

Item Number: 15
Application No: 22/00865/LBC
Parish: Staxton/Willerby Parish Council
Appn. Type: Listed Building Consent
Applicant: Claire Harvey (S & H Quality Developments)
Proposal: Change of use and alterations to former Methodist Chapel to form 1no. two bedroom dwelling to include formation of first floor level and installation of new window to east elevation, replacement of existing slate roof and installation of 4no. conservation rooflights and 2no. extraction vents, lowering existing door threshold level and repointing of façade
Location: Staxton Methodist Church Main Street Staxton Scarborough North Yorkshire

Registration Date: 27 July 2022
8/13 Wk Expiry Date: 21 September 2022
Overall Expiry Date: 20 September 2022
Case Officer: Alan Goforth **Ext:** 43332

CONSULTATIONS:

Initial consultation

Building Conservation Officer No objection refer to earlier response to withdrawn application for recommended conditions.
Staxton/Willerby Parish Council No response received

Re-consultation (Revised/corrected application form; DAS and proposed plans. Further info on rear windows and underpinning. Reduction to 2no. rooflights in rear roof slope)

Building Conservation Officer No objection
Staxton/Willerby Parish Council No response received

Representations (4): Rachel Hall, B & M Stonehouse, J & K Stonehouse, K & M Lepper (all objections)

BACKGROUND:

The application is to be determined by Planning Committee as representations received in response to the consultation exercise have raised objections relating to the impact of the proposed alterations on the significance of the listed building.

SITE:

The application site is within Development Limits on the eastern side of Staxton (Service Village). The application site comprises the Grade II listed Primitive Methodist Chapel located on the south side of the road set back behind a grass verge.

The chapel is a single storey, rectangular building with a footprint of approximately 70m². The chapel is constructed from red brick in Flemish bond, with a slate covered hipped roof. The building stands approximately 5 metres to the eaves and 7 metres to the apex. The chapel has the year 1847 on a datestone above the arched doorway in the front, north facing elevation. The single entrance door is right-of-centre and comprises 4-panels with a radial fanlight above. There are three round arched, tall

windows with painted stone sills on the front (north) elevation and three on the rear (south) elevation. There are no openings in the two side elevations.

The chapel is currently disused and in a state of disrepair with the windows boarded up.

HISTORY:

22/00864/FUL- Change of use and alterations of former Methodist Chapel to form 1no. two bedroom dwelling with formation of first floor level to include installation of new window to east elevation, 2no. rooflights to south elevation, 1no. rooflight to east elevation and 1no. rooflight to west elevation. UNDER CONSIDERATION.

21/01493/FUL- Change of use of former Methodist Chapel to form 1no. two bedroom dwelling to include installation of new windows to east elevation and formation of first floor level with associated parking and landscaping. WITHDRAWN 02.02.2022.

21/01494/LBC- Change of use, conversion and alterations to former Methodist Chapel to form 1no. two bedroom dwelling to include installation of new windows to east elevation, formation of first floor level, removal of windows to south elevation and bricking up, insertion of air bricks into west elevation, replacement of existing slate roof, lowering existing door threshold level and installation of new door frame and repointing of façade. WITHDRAWN 02.02.2022.

PROPOSAL:

Listed Building Consent is sought for the change of use and alterations to former Methodist Chapel to form 1no. two bedroom dwelling to include formation of first floor level and installation of new window to east elevation, replacement of existing slate roof and installation of 4no. conservation rooflights and 2no. extraction vents, lowering existing door threshold level and repointing of façade.

The application is a resubmission following on from the earlier withdrawn application. The application was withdrawn to allow the applicant time to resolve issues raised in respect of the design detailing.

The application site comprises the footprint of the chapel building itself with no associated external areas.

The proposed works would involve the repointing of the brickwork with lime mortar to match existing and the removal of plaster and insulated plasterboard drylining to the inner walls. The existing roof slates would be removed and a roof membrane and insulation installed and the slates re-laid. The majority of the existing slate will be reused although any required replacements would be used on the rear, non-public, roof elevation. Rainwater goods would be replaced with cast iron guttering and downpipes.

The existing suspended timber floor would be removed and the ground floor level lowered to create sufficient headroom for two floors. A new insulated concrete floor would be formed. The structural survey has also recommended that due to the additional load from the first floor underpinning works are carried out to the existing walls below ground level from inside the chapel itself.

The proposed floor plans for the conversion show the ground floor would comprise an open plan kitchen/dining/sitting area with a separate utility space and WC. A staircase would be installed adjacent to the rear wall leading to a first floor landing providing access to 2no. bedrooms and a bathroom.

The existing front door would be retained and refurbished and there would be 2no. wall lights attached to the front elevation flanking the entrance. The 3no. windows on the front elevation and the 3no. windows in the rear elevation would be retained with repairs undertaken to the timber frames. The glazing will be replaced with slim double glazed units with the 3no. windows in the rear elevation being obscured glazed and fixed/non-openable.

A first floor window would be formed in the eastern side elevation. The window is shown on the elevation drawing as being a fixed/non-openable pane within a black, recessed frame. The western side elevation would remain blank.

During the course of the application the plans were amended to omit two of the rooflights proposed to be installed in the rear (south) slope serving the bedrooms. As a result the proposal, as amended, would involve the installation of a total of 4no. conservation rooflights. There would be 2no. rooflights in the rear roof slope providing light to the staircase and first floor landing, 1no. rooflight in the east roof slope serving bedroom 1 and 1no. rooflight in the west roof slope serving bedroom 2. There would be no rooflights in the front, road facing roofslope although two small roof mounted triangular lead extraction vents would be inserted.

POLICIES:

The Ryedale Plan - Local Plan Strategy (2013)

Local Plan Strategy - Policy SP12 Heritage

Local Plan Strategy - Policy SP16 Design

Local Plan Strategy - Policy SP19 Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development

Local Plan Strategy - Policy SP20 Generic Development Management Issues

Material Considerations

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

National Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)

Relevant Legislation

Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 Section 66: General duty as respects listed buildings in exercise of planning functions:

“In considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority... shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.”

REPRESENTATIONS:

In response to the consultation the LPA received 4 representations all of which raise objections to the application. The representations are from the occupants of: 1 Chapel Close, Main Street, Staxton; Glebe Cottage, Main Street, Staxton; May Farm, Main Street, Staxton; and Goslingmire Farm, Hutton Rudby.

The objections relevant to this application for LBC are summarised as follows:-

- The rooflights are not necessary and change the character of the building
- The proposed window in the east elevation is not in keeping with the design of the windows in the rest of building.
- The building does not lend itself for residential purposes due to the listing and footprint of the Chapel.

The objections also highlighted some minor inconsistencies and errors within the supporting documents and drawings which were subsequently corrected by the applicant's agent in the drawings and documents the subject of the re-consultation exercise.

APPRAISAL:

The proposed works affect a building listed under the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 for its special architectural or historic interest.

Staxton Primitive Methodist Chapel is Grade II listed and, as such, Ryedale District Council has a statutory duty to have special regard for the preservation of the listed building.

The chapel is visually prominent on the road frontage on the eastern side of Staxton. The chapel's windows, door, exterior materials and simple rectangular form make the strongest contribution to the significance of the listed building. The chapel building is part of the heritage of the settlement and makes a positive contribution to the village streetscape.

However, the redundant chapel appears to be in need of repair and renovation and is at risk of continued deterioration without significant intervention and suitable re-use.

Policy SP12 seeks to conserve and, where appropriate, enhance designated historic assets and their settings. Local and national planning policy (NPPF) also recognises the importance of securing the future of heritage assets particularly those at risk and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation.

The proposed conversion would include repairs to the walls, windows and roof that would halt any deterioration of the condition of the building. The repairs would utilise traditional materials and techniques sensitive to the historic fabric and sympathetic to the character and appearance of the building by retaining existing openings, detailing and original features.

The earlier withdrawn application proposed the 'bricking up' of the three rear windows on the southern elevation. The windows form a strong component of the special interest of the listed building and such works were deemed to have an unacceptable impact on the character and appearance of the building. The current application proposes to retain the window frames, make any necessary repairs and insert obscure glazing to all three units.

The earlier withdrawn application also proposed two windows in the currently blank eastern elevation which was considered to give rise to harm to the special interest of the building by reason of their proportions/design not relating to the architecture of the building. The current application proposes a single window at first floor level which would be a simple rectangular pane set in a dark frame and recessed in the wall to contrast with the existing traditional round-arched sash windows present in the front and rear of the chapel.

The Building Conservation Officer has confirmed no objection to the principle of the insertion of an additional window into the eastern elevation to facilitate conversion. The current proposal aligns with the Building Conservation Officer's earlier recommendation (in response to the withdrawn application) for the additional window opening to be identifiable as a later addition appearing as a recessed, modern opening in a dark coloured frame.

The reduction in the number of rooflights minimises intervention in the roof and disturbance to the existing fabric of the chapel. The rooflights are of modest proportions and, as amended, are not excessive in number. The rooflights would be conservation type and top hung to reduce the visual impact and this would be controlled by condition.

The Building Conservation Officer has no objections to the works to the listed building and has recommended submission of details in relation to the construction and design detail which is covered by a series of conditions.

The recommended conditions would retain control over the conversion work and its impact on the historic fabric of the building including the requirement for a construction method statement detailing the proposed underpinning works; the proposed first floor structure and its junctions/connections with

the listed building; and the inclusion of a cross section showing the junction of new floor with existing windows.

It is considered that the conversion work would retain the significance of the simple vernacular architectural form of the building and being clearly identifiable as a former chapel within the streetscene its historic interest will be maintained as a tangible aspect of Methodist worship in the village.

The proposed internal and external alterations and additional window and rooflight openings are sympathetic and proportionate and respect the historic character and appearance of the chapel without any significant impact on the original fabric of the building.

The proposed development would include repairs and alterations that would halt and reverse the deterioration of the condition of the building. The conversion to form a single dwelling is considered a viable use which would lessen the risk of future deterioration of the historic fabric of the building or its structural condition in accordance with national and local planning policy.

Overall, it is considered that the proposed repairs and alterations take into account the special interest of the building and are those necessary to facilitate the conversion to residential use. The proposed works are appropriate and sympathetic to the character and appearance of the listed building and the proposal is therefore considered to comply with the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990; the requirements of Section 16 of the NPPF and Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the RPLPS.

In light of the above it is recommended to Members that this application for Listed Building Consent is approved.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval

1 The development hereby permitted shall be begun on or before .

Reason:- To ensure compliance with Section 18(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings & Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:

Location Plan ref. 1347 E01 Rev C, dated May 2021
Proposed Plans, Elevations, Section & Site Plan ref. 1347 P01 Rev E, dated 01.09.2022

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

3 Prior to the commencement of development a Construction Method Statement (CMS) shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval in writing. The CMS shall provide details of the following:-

- i. underpinning works
- ii. the proposed first floor structure and its junctions/connections with the listed building
- iii. cross section showing junction of new floor with existing windows

Reason: To preserve the appearance and historic fabric of the building in accordance with the requirements of Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

4 Prior to the commencement of any re-pointing of existing brickwork details of the lime pointing mix and a sample shall be provided to the Local Planning Authority for approval in writing.

Reason: To preserve the appearance of the building in accordance with the requirements of Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 5 Prior to the installation of any exterior mechanical extraction systems; ventilation or flue outlets and soil pipes details of the system specification, size, appearance and location shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To preserve the appearance of the building and in the interests of residential amenity to comply with Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 6 The existing slate roof covering shall be carefully removed as necessary with slates that are of a suitable condition for re-use set aside to be re-fixed to the building. Details and samples of any new replacement slates to be used on the roof of the building the subject of this permission shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to use.

Reason: To prioritise the use of reclaimed materials and to ensure an appropriate external appearance in accordance with the requirements of Policies SP13, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 7 All existing windows shall be retained and made good as necessary. The 3no. windows in the rear (south) elevation shall be entirely obscure glazed and fixed/non-openable.

Reason: To preserve the appearance of the building and in the interests of residential amenity to comply with Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 8 The first floor window in the eastern elevation shall be fixed/non-openable with a black frame and recessed as shown on the approved elevation drawing.

Reason: To ensure an appropriate external appearance in accordance with the requirements of Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 9 All rooflights shall be of a conservation type and be top hung opening. All rooflights shall be installed at high level as shown on the approved elevation and section drawing with the lowest part of the rooflight being at least 2 metres above the finished first floor level.

Reason: To preserve the appearance of the building in accordance with the requirements of Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 10 All rainwater goods shall be cast iron with a black finish. The guttering shall be fixed by means of driven gutter spikes and no fascia boarding shall be used.

Reason: To preserve the appearance of the building in accordance with the requirements of Policies SP12, SP16 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.

- 11 External lighting on the building shall be limited to the 2no. wall lights flanking the front door as shown on the approved elevation drawing and the units shall provide down lighting only.

Reason: In the interests of the reduction of light pollution in this rural location and in the interests of protected species in compliance with Policies SP14 and SP20 of the Ryedale Plan- Local Plan Strategy.